

**Caerphilly County Borough Council**

**JOINT HOUSING LAND AVAILABILITY STUDY 2013**

**Between Caerphilly County Borough Council and the Study Group:**

Home Builders' Federation  
Linc Cymru Housing Association  
Wales and West Housing Association  
Charter Housing Association  
United Welsh Housing Association  
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water  
Asbri Planning  
Persimmon Homes

March 2014

## **CONTENTS**

- 1 Summary
- 2 Housing Land Supply
- 3 Commentary
- 4 Monitoring Data

Appendix 1 – Site Schedules

Appendix 2 – Past Completions Data

Appendix 3 – Previous Land Supply Data

## **1 SUMMARY**

- 1.1 This is the Caerphilly County Borough Council Joint Housing Land Availability Study for 2013 which presents the housing land supply for the area at the base date of 1 April 2013. It replaces the report for 2012.
- 1.2 The JHLAS has been prepared in accordance with the requirements of Planning Policy Wales, Technical Advice Note (TAN) 1 and the Guidance Note on the JHLAS process (September 2012). Please refer to these documents for details of the requirement for the maintenance of a five year housing land supply in each local planning authority area and the process for undertaking the JHLASs (<http://wales.gov.uk/topics/planning/policy>).
- 1.3 Section 2 sets out details of the housing land supply and how it has been calculated. It shows that based on the residual method set out in TAN 1, Caerphilly County Borough has 2.9 years housing land supply.

### **Involvement**

- 1.4 The housing land supply has been actively assessed in conjunction with the Home Builders Federation (HBF). Those other members of the Study Group, as set out at the start of this document, have also been consulted during the various stages of the process.

### **Report Production**

- 1.5 The Council issued draft site schedules and site proformas for consultation on 19 July 2013 for a period of three weeks until 9 August 2013, and for a further period between 16 August and 6 September 2013. Comments were provided by the HBF, Asbri Planning and Persimmon Homes during this period. A draft Statement of Common Ground (SoCG) was subsequently prepared and the Study Group was consulted on 29 September 2013. The final version was submitted to Welsh Government on 9 October 2013.
- 1.6 This report has been prepared on the basis of the SoCG.
- 1.7 It was necessary for an appointed planning inspector to resolve a number of disputed matters because details within the site schedule could not be agreed by all parties through the SoCG stage.
- 1.8 The appointed planning inspector subsequently made a recommendation to Welsh Government on the housing land supply, including recommendations on the points of dispute. The planning inspector's recommendations were considered by Welsh Government, relevant amendments were made to the site schedules by Caerphilly and this information has been incorporated into this report.

## **2 HOUSING LAND SUPPLY**

- 2.1 The five year land supply comprises sites with planning permission (outline or full) and sites allocated for housing in adopted development plans, categorised as prescribed in TAN 1.

- 2.2 The land supply has been calculated using the residual method, based on the Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021, adopted November 2010.

<b>Housing Land Supply 1 April 2013 – 2018 – Large Sites</b>								
	Proposed units	5 Year Land Supply (TAN 1 Categories)				Beyond 5 Years		Completed Since Last Study
		Under construction	1	2	2*	3(i)	3(ii)	
<b>Total</b>	5450	140	274	1255	0	3771	10	306

- 2.3 Five year land supply breakdown (i.e. categories 1, 2, 2\* and under construction):

Private	1468
Housing Association	201
<b>Total</b>	<b>1669</b>

- 2.4 **Small Site Supply** – The contribution from small sites of less than 10 dwellings is based on the number of completions for the last five years.

**Table 2 – Small Site Completions for the Previous Five Years**

2008/9	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	<b>Total</b>
65	51	48	57	38	<b>259</b>

- 2.5 The overall **total five year housing land supply** (large and small sites) is **1928**.

**Table 3 – Five Year Land Supply Calculation (Residual Method)**

A	Total housing requirement (as set out in the adopted Local Development Plan)	8625
B	Completions to base date (large and small sites)	3287
C	Residual requirement	5338
D	Five year requirement	3336
E	Annual need	667
F	Total five year land supply	1928
<b>G</b>	<b>Land supply in years (F/E)</b>	<b>2.9</b>

**Table 3b – Five Year Land Supply Calculation (Past Building Rates Method)**

- 2.6 Whilst the residual method has been used as the basis for calculating the land supply within this study, it has been customary in the past, and is in line with the advice in the TAN, to indicate how the land supply compares with past levels of completions. This has generally been included as a check against deficiencies in the residual method, which may occur in certain circumstances.

A	Total previous five year completions (2008/9 – 2012/13)	1779
B	Average annual completions	356
C	Total five year land supply	1928
<b>D</b>	<b>Land supply in years (C/B)</b>	<b>5.4</b>

### **3 COMMENTARY**

#### **Land Supply Statement**

- 3.1 The Council recognises that, under the residual method, the land supply is below five years. In such instances, paragraph 5.1 of TAN 1 states that the LPA "must include a statement in the JHLA study outlining the measures it is taking to address the shortfall in housing land supply".
- 3.2 Policy SP14 of the Adopted LDP sets out a requirement for 8,625 dwellings to be developed over the plan period, but makes provision for 10,269 dwellings to allow for flexibility and choice. The Annual Monitoring Report (AMR) is the main mechanism for reviewing the relevance and success of the policies contained in the LDP and for identifying any changes that may be necessary. LDP Regulation 37 prescribes two indicators that must be included within the AMR, one of which specifically relates to housing land supply, taken from the current Housing Land Availability Study. In line with Para 4.1 of TAN1 where the JHLAS, and subsequently the AMR, identifies a shortfall in the housing land requirement, the Council will need to consider in consultation with the Welsh Government whether it would be appropriate or necessary to review the LDP in whole or in part.
- 3.3 The 2013 AMR concluded that whilst the LDP Development Strategy remains sound, the downturn in the economy has had a marked effect on house building rates. Viability continues to be a major issue in overall house building and this has an adverse impact on the levels of affordable housing being delivered through the planning system.
- 3.4 The lack of a five-year housing land supply is a matter of concern that needs to be addressed if the overall housing requirement is to be met over the plan period. The monitoring evidence indicates that it is unlikely that this position will improve in the short term.
- 3.5 Furthermore, the provision of 41,000 dwellings, including 18,000 on greenfield sites in north Cardiff through the Cardiff LDP has the potential to attract volume house builders into Cardiff and away from neighbouring areas, such as Caerphilly. This is particularly pertinent to Caerphilly Basin where there is a brownfield strategy.
- 3.6 Although, to date, substantial progress has been made in terms of implementing the proposals set out within the Caerphilly LDP, the decision was taken that policies SP3 (Development Strategy – SCC) and SP15 (Affordable Housing Target) have failed to be delivered (as well as others which are less pertinent to housing land supply), on the basis of those monitoring targets and indicators set out in the AMR, and that a review of the LDP has been triggered. It is considered that this process will allow the Council to address the shortfall in its housing land supply by bringing forward viable and developable sites.
- 3.7 On 8<sup>th</sup> October 2013 the Council formally resolved to begin preparation of a 1<sup>st</sup> Review of the LDP. As part of the review process, a revised Delivery Agreement has been prepared, which has been approved by Council and the Welsh Government. This sets out the timetable for the LDP 1<sup>st</sup> Review. In

accordance with this timetable, the 1<sup>st</sup> Review should be adopted by late 2017.

- 3.8 As part of the Review process, a call for candidate sites was issued. This ended on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2014 and the Council is actively assessing the sites put forward to determine their suitability for inclusion within the Plan for housing and other uses. This process will ensure that future allocations in the LDP are robust and sustainable.

### Section 106 Agreements

- 3.9 As at 1 April 2013, a number of sites of 10 or more dwellings were awaiting completion of a Section 106 agreement:

**Table 4 – Section 106 Agreements**

<b>Application Reference</b>	<b>Site Name</b>	<b>Number of Units</b>
P/05/1091	Land adjacent to Marne Street, Cwmcarn	15
P/05/1683	Land at Austin Grange, Bartlett Street, Caerphilly	34
P/06/0037	Waterloo Works, Machen	545
07/0077/FULL	The Rhos, Bedwas Road, Caerphilly	20
08/0752/OUT	Land at Hawtin Park, Pontllanfraith	134
09/0243/OUT	Land at former Windsor Colliery, Abertridwr	160
09/0614/OUT	Land to rear of Ty Fry Road, Aberbargoed	15
10/0550/OUT	Former BSW Sawmills, Senghenydd	100
12/0030/NCC	Land at George Street, Cwmcarn	17
12/0104/NCC	East of Bedwellty Road, Aberbargoed	180
12/0269/NCC	Land at Gellideg Ind Est, Maesycwmmmer	95
12/0578/OUT	Land west of Old Pant Road, Panside	57
12/0898/FULL	Land at Tyn y Wern Terrace, Trethomas	22
13/0416/FULL	Land at Mill Road, Caerphilly	17
		<b>1411</b>

- 3.10 Although some of these sites are within the site schedule due to their status as LDP sites, the majority of the 1411 units identified are not within the five year land supply at present. These sites are likely to enter the land supply during future studies, once the S106s have been agreed. This demonstrates that there is additional land available that will potentially come forward to provide a future supply of housing land.

## 4 MONITORING DATA

- 4.1 TAN 1 requires the JHLAS Report to provide additional information on the development of land for housing covering the use of previously developed land, the use of sites subject to flood risk constraints and the type of housing being developed (i.e. houses, flats, other). This data is set out below:

**Table 5 – Use of Previously Developed Land (Large Sites)**

<b>Total Number and % of Homes by Category and Land Type</b>												
Year	5 Year Supply				3i and 3ii Categories				Completions 2012/13			
	Greenfield		Brownfield		Greenfield		Brownfield		Greenfield		Brownfield	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
2011	322	14	1969	86	795	20	3095	80	29	9	281	91
2012	168	8.8	1741	91.2	846	21.5	3097	78.5	57	17.1	276	82.9
2013	188	11.3	1481	88.7	814	21.5	2967	78.5	12	3.9	294	96.1
2014												
2015												
2016												

**Table 6 – Sites Subject to Flood Risk Constraints (Large Sites)**

<b>Total Number and % of Homes by Category and Land Type</b>												
Year	5 Year Supply				3i and 3ii Categories				Completions 2012/13			
	C1		C2		C1		C2		C1		C2	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
2011	0	0	135	6	250	6	3	0.1	0	0	10	3
2012	77	3.5	168	7.6	298	7.6	31	0.8	0	0	35	10.5
2013	108	6.5	63	3.8	267	7.1	20	0.5	0	0	99	32.4
2014												
2015												
2016												

**Table 7 – Completions by House Type – 1 April 2012 to 31 March 2013**

- 335 houses (97%)
- 9 flats (3%)

## Appendix 1 – Site Schedule

See separate document

## Appendix 2 – Past Completion Data

	Number of Homes Completed on:		
Year	Large Sites	Small Sites	Total Completions
2009	322	65	387
2010	249	51	300
2011	310	48	358
2012	333	57	390
2013	306	38	344

## Appendix 3 – Previous Land Supply Data

	5 Year Supply – Number of Homes			Number of Years Supply	Supply Beyond 5 Years – Number of Homes	
Year	1	2	2*		3i	3ii
2008	364	1333	0	22.5	1158	0
2009	437	1515	0	21.2	1042	0
2010	403	1316	0	14.2	1697	0
2011	287	2004	0	4.3	3890	0
2012	277	1575	0	3.5	3943	0

## Appendix 4 – Inspector's Report

See attached document



Caerphilly County Borough Council  
 Joint Housing Land Availability Study 2013  
 Appendix 1 - Site Schedule

Site ID	Site Name	Settlement	Total	Total complete	Complete since last	NS	UC	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2*	3i	3ii
<b>Private Sector Sites</b>															
288	Bedwellty Road	Aberbargoed	118	0	0	118	0	24	24	25	25	20	0	0	0
1114	Aberbargoed Plateau	Aberbargoed	413	0	0	413	0	0	0	0	30	30	0	353	0
1773	Bedwellty Comprehensive School	Aberbargoed	74	0	0	74	0	0	0	0	20	20	0	34	0
18	Windsor Colliery	Abertridwr	193	0	0	193	0	0	0	30	30	0	0	133	0
1786	Land east of Coedcae Road	Abertridwr	27	0	0	27	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	27	0
20	Land at Greensway	Abertysswg	28	0	0	28	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	28	0
1669	Land South West of Carn Y Tyla Terrace	Abertysswg	133	0	0	133	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	130	0
1265	Land adjacent to Gelynos Avenue	Argoed	13	8	0	4	1	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1220	Park Estate	Bargoed	53	0	0	53	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	53	0
1772	Bargoed Retail Plateau	Bargoed	48	0	0	48	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	48	0
306	Bedwas Colliery	Bedwas	630	0	0	630	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	630	0
1562	Land at St Mary's street, Bedwas	Bedwas	12	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	0
1774	Blackwood Ambulance Station	Blackwood	24	0	0	24	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	24	0
500	Gas Works Site (Mill Court)	Caerphilly	84	7	7	46	31	16	30	0	0	0	0	0	0
1108	Land between Van Road & The Railway (Phase 2)	Caerphilly	42	0	0	42	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	42	0
1261	Castlegate	Caerphilly	593	576	7	0	17	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1644	Cardiff Road/Pentrebane Street	Caerphilly	127	0	0	127	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	127	0
1754	Land at Pontypandy Industrial Estate (Castle Reach)	Caerphilly	199	26	26	152	21	30	30	30	30	32	0	0	0
1781	St James Primary School	Caerphilly	49	0	0	49	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	49	0
1782	Land at Venosa Trading Estate (Virginia Grove)	Caerphilly	116	58	47	32	26	16	16	0	0	0	0	0	0
1783	Caerphilly Miners Hospital	Caerphilly	82	0	0	82	0	47	35	0	0	0	0	0	0
1784	Hendre Infants School	Caerphilly	16	0	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	16	0
1785	Cwm Ifor Primary School	Caerphilly	46	0	0	46	0	0	0	0	16	16	0	14	0
1893	Land at former Gledyr Bungalow, Caerphilly	Caerphilly	14	0	0	14	0	0	0	7	7	0	0	0	0
472	Caerphilly Miners Hospital (Phase 1)	Caerphilly	28	0	0	28	0	0	0	14	14	0	0	0	0
1775	Pencoed Avenue (west)	Cefn Fforest	47	0	0	47	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	47	0
1944	Land east of Bryn Road	Cefn Fforest	24	0	0	24	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	24	0
1867	Land at Pendinas Avenue, Croespenmaen	Croespenmaen	29	0	0	29	0	10	19	0	0	0	0	0	0
1788	The Monkey PH, Crosskeys	Crosskeys	11	0	0	11	0	6	5	0	0	0	0	0	0
285	Former Holly House Nursing Home	Fleur-de-Lys	12	0	0	12	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	11	0
1777	Land at Railway Terrace, Fochriw	Fochriw	147	0	0	147	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	147	0
145	Greenhill Primary School	Gelligaer	32	0	0	32	0	0	0	16	16	0	0	0	0
1373	Land off Valley View	Hengoed	25	11	0	14	0	1	1	1	1	1	0	9	0
307	Alexander House, Colliery Road	Llanbradach	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0
1780	Tyn Y Waun Farm	Machen	10	0	0	10	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	9	0
1749	Waterloo Works	Machen	545	0	0	545	0	0	0	0	30	30	0	485	0
1778	Land at Gellideg Heights (Phase 1)	Maesycwmmmer	144	0	0	144	0	0	0	35	30	30	0	49	0
334	Land at Gellideg Heights (Phase 2)	Maesycwmmmer	91	0	0	91	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	82	0
1117	Land adjacent to Abernant Road, Markham	Markham	82	1	0	81	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	80	0
1770	Land to the east of Handball Court	Nelson	90	0	0	90	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	90	0
469	Land at Graig Rhymney	New Tredegar	30	0	0	30	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	30	0
1382	Land at Fields Park	Newbridge	80	0	0	80	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	80	0
1624	The Stores, Albertina Road	Newbridge	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0
1892	Land West of the A467 and Afon Ebbw (Coed Celynen Phase 2)	Newbridge	123	113	52	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1659	Former Enco Site, North Road, Newbridge	Newbridge	23	0	0	23	0	0	0	0	12	11	0	0	0
1563	Land off Bryn Howard Terrace (Glynderwen Meadows)	Oakdale	65	65	48	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1112	Land west of Old Pant Road	Pantside	56	0	0	56	0	0	0	16	20	20	0	0	0
1354	Land at Hawtin Park	Pontllanfraith	194	0	0	194	0	0	0	0	40	37	0	117	0
16	Gelli Garage, Newport Road	Pontllanfraith	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0
1769	Land adjacent to Brynglas	Pontlottyn	56	56	12	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1670	Former depot south of Pontlottyn Link Road	Pontlottyn	36	0	0	36	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	36	0
498	Suflex Factory	Pontymister	87	0	0	87	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	87	0
281	Land at Hilary Rise	Pontywaun	20	0	0	20	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	20	0
572	Land South of Merthyr Road, Princetown	Princetown	140	2	0	138	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	138	0
573	Maerdy Crossing, Rhymney	Rhymney	57	0	0	57	0	0	0	0	28	29	0	0	0
1116	Lower Hill Street, Rhymney	Rhymney	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0
1163	Land East of Llechryd Bungalow, Llechryd	Rhymney	39	0	0	39	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	39	0
1124	Maerdy Garage, adjacent to Maerdy House	Rhymney	16	0	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	16	0
1779	Land at Station Approach, Risca	Risca	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	0
1457	Eastern part of land adjacent to River Ebbw	Risca	48	0	0	48	0	0	0	0	24	24	0	0	0
1730	Land below Coronation Terrace	Senghenydd	12	0	0	12	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12	0
292	Former Allotments, between B4263 and Coronation Terrace, Senghenydd, Caerphilly	Senghenydd	20	0	0	20	0	0	0	10	10	0	0	0	0
1335	Tir-y-berth	Tiryberth	173	0	0	173	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	173	0
488	Former Petrol Filling Station, Newport Road	Trethomas	10	0	0	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10
1622	Land north east of Llanarth Street	Wattsville	65	62	4	2	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
491	Woodfield House, Penmaen Road, Woodfieldside	Woodfieldside	28	14	14	4	10	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
261	Land adjacent to Pen-y-Cwarel Road	Wyllie	56	0	0	56	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	56	0
294	Penallta Yard	Ystrad Mynach	9	0	0	9	0	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	0
805	Penallta Colliery (Cwm Calon)	Ystrad Mynach	547	425	70	108	14	54	54	0	0	0	0	0	0
894	Land to rear of Pantycelyn Street	Ystrad Mynach	24	22	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0
894	Penallta Colliery, Listed Building Development, Dyffryn Street	Ystrad Mynach	188	26	0	162	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	162	0

VM\_JHLAS\_site\_schedule

1776	Land at New Road	Ystrad Mynach	18	0	0	18	0	0	0	9	9	0	0	0	0
<b>Housing Association Sites</b>															
1771	Aberbargoed and District Hospital	Aberbargoed	17	0	0	17	0	0	17	0	0	0	0	0	0
1747	Former Council Yard, Bridge Street, Abercarn	Abercarn	40	0	0	40	0	0	0	0	20	19	0	0	0
1857	Cats House and Bedwas Workmens Club	Bedwas	25	0	0	25	0	0	25	0	0	0	0	0	0
1750	Land South of Thorncombe Road	Blackwood	12	0	0	12	0	0	6	6	0	0	0	0	0
1868	Former Jupiter Furniture Store, Caerphilly	Caerphilly	28	19	19	0	9	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1154	Pencoed Avenue (East)	Cefn Fforest	16	0	0	16	0	16	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
487	Oak Terrace	Fleur-de-Lys	21	0	0	21	0	10	11	0	0	0	0	0	0
1795	Land at Former Coal Yard, Llancaiach View	Nelson	35	0	0	35	0	17	18	0	0	0	0	0	0
1492	Land at the Quarry, Moriah Hill	Risca	14	0	0	14	0	14	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
1256	Land adjacent to The Grove	Trethomas	13	0	0	13	0	0	13	0	0	0	0	0	0
			<b>6721</b>	<b>1472</b>	<b>287</b>	<b>5118</b>	<b>131</b>	<b>217</b>	<b>235</b>	<b>193</b>	<b>392</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>3771</b>	<b>10</b>

## **Adroddiad ar gyd-astudiaethau argaeledd tir ar gyfer tai**

gan R.M. Poppleton DipTP, DMS, MRTPI, JP  
Arolygydd a benodir gan Weinidogion Cymru  
Dyddiad: 28/03/2014

## **Report on Joint Housing Land Availability Study**

by R.M. Poppleton DipTP, DMS, MRTPI, JP  
an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers  
Date: 28/03/2014

Ref: JHLAS/13/K6920/515547

Local Planning Authority: **Caerphilly County Borough Council**

- This report concerns the Caerphilly County Borough Council Joint Housing Land Availability Study (JHLAS) 2013.
- The matters in dispute are set out in the JHLAS Statement of Common Ground (SoCG) submitted to the Welsh Government (WG) in November 2013.

### **Recommendation**

1. That the 2013 JHLAS housing land supply figure for the Caerphilly County Borough Council planning area be determined as 2.9 years.

### **Context of the Recommendation**

2. Local Planning Authorities have a duty to ensure that sufficient land is genuinely available or will become available to provide a 5 year supply of land for housing<sup>1</sup>. The purpose of preparing a JHLAS is to:
  - Monitor the provision of market and affordable housing;
  - Provide an agreed statement of residential land availability for development planning and control purposes; and
  - Set out the need for action in situations where an insufficient supply is identified<sup>2</sup>.
3. The scope of this report is to recommend an appropriate housing land supply figure in respect of the Caerphilly County Borough Council area, in the light of the matters in dispute concerning the calculation of such a figure and the available evidence.

### **Main Issues**

4. The Statement of Common Ground (SoCG) confirms that the Study Group agrees that the residual method should be used to determine the housing land supply. Fifteen sites are in dispute between the Study Group members. The principal issue is whether or not each of these disputed sites should contribute towards the supply of land for housing as at the base date of the study (1 April 2013).

<sup>1</sup> PPW Edition 6 paragraph 9.2.3

<sup>2</sup> TAN 1: Joint Housing Land Availability Studies (June 2006) paragraph 2.1

## Reasons

5. The minimum agreed number of units in the land supply is 1,668 units, including an allowance for small sites. In addition to this there are fifteen disputed sites, which account for an additional 329 units.
6. TAN 1 provides advice on the criteria to be applied in considering whether sites may be regarded as genuinely available within a five year period. The TAN also provides advice on sites that have remained in the land supply for periods well in excess of five years. I have considered the disputed sites on the available evidence and in line with the TAN and the WG Guidance.
7. Bedwellty Road, Aberbargoed (Site 288) (10 units in dispute): This site benefits from full planning permission and, from the information contained in the SoCG, it appears that commencement by a developer is imminent. Asbri Planning considers that the proposed rate of completions from 2016 onwards is unrealistic. The Council draws attention to the fact that the phasing post-2016 is similar to that which is agreed for the first two years of the study. No evidence has been presented of any constraints which may put at risk the delivery timescale proposed by the Council. I therefore find that the 10 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
8. Aberbargoed Plateau, Aberbargoed (Site 1114) (60 units in dispute): This Council-owned site is allocated for residential use in the adopted LDP but does not have planning permission. The site was first included in the JHLAS in 2011. I note that the majority of units (353 out of 413) have been placed in category 3(i), and that constraints to the site's development include potential required improvements to the gas and public sewerage networks. The SoCG identifies that access to the site is now in place, land remediation for residential use will be completed in the near future and that a marketing / development brief is currently being prepared. The area of dispute centres on whether it is reasonable to expect the site to be sold to a developer, and full permission gained, in time to allow for first completions in year 4 of the study period. Given that the site is being prepared for development and is allocated in the adopted LDP, I consider that the timescale proposed by the Council is realistic. For this reason I find that the 60 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
9. Bedwellty Comprehensive School, Aberbargoed (Site 1773) (40 units in dispute): This Council-owned site is allocated for residential use in the adopted LDP but does not have planning permission. The SoCG identifies ecological constraints to the site's development including Tree Protection Orders and a Special Area of Conservation which lie adjacent to the site. No other constraints are identified. The Council states that discussions are ongoing with a Registered Social Landlord (RSL) regarding the site's development. There is no evidence before me to indicate that the Council's proposed delivery timescale, with first completions in year 4 of the study period, is unrealistic. I also note that the site has only been included in the JHLAS since 2011. Accordingly I find that the 40 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
10. Bedwas Colliery, Bedwas (Site 306) (0 units in dispute): The Council has categorised this site as 3(i). Asbri Planning considers that constraints to the site's development are such that it should be re-categorised 3(ii). All parties agree that the site should not contribute to the land supply. I have therefore not included this site in my calculation of the 5 year land supply.
11. Land at St. Mary's Street, Bedwas (Site 1562) (12 units in dispute): Full planning permission was granted for this site in January 2008 and an extension of time limit

was approved in March 2013. In the SoCG, the HBF cites comments which it has obtained from the landowner's agent indicating that the site is subject to "abnormal costs which has made it unattractive to developers". Although no information is provided on specific constraints, the landowner's agent nevertheless recommends that the site should be reclassified within category 3. I note that the site has remained within the land supply in excess of five years. Paragraph 7.4.1 of TAN 1 indicates that there should be a presumption to reclassify sites which have remained undeveloped for over five years into category 3i. As reclassification is supported by the landowner's agent, I find no compelling justification to keep the site within category 2. I find that the 12 disputed units should be removed from the 5 year land supply.

12. Gas Works Site (Mill Court), Caerphilly (Site 500) (0 units in dispute): The parties agree that this site should contribute to the land supply but there is disagreement on the likely phasing. The main purpose of this report is to recommend a land supply figure. I have not given this site further consideration but have included the site in my calculation of the 5 year land supply.
13. Caerphilly Miners Hospital (Phase 2), Caerphilly (Site 1945) (14 units in dispute): This Council-owned site is allocated in the adopted LDP but does not have planning permission. This is the first year that the site has been included in the land supply: it appears that the progress of development on the adjacent site, along with discussions between the Council and an RSL concerning the site's development, has prompted its inclusion. Asbri Planning considers that the first 14 units are likely to be completed in 2018 and that the remaining 14 units should be reclassified as category 3i and removed from the 5 year supply. The Council forecasts 14 completions in 2016 and a further 14 in 2017. Given the progress on the neighbouring site, and the fact that the site is allocated for residential use in the adopted plan, I consider the Council's proposed timescale to be realistic. I find that the 14 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
14. Land at former Gledyr Bungalow, Caerphilly (Site 1893) (14 units in dispute): The granting of outline planning permission for this site in August 2012 has prompted the Council to propose it for inclusion in the JHLAS for the first time. Asbri Planning and Persimmon consider that the site should be classified as 3i due to market constraints on apartments. The developer's intention is not cited in the SoCG; however, the fact that a planning application was made to the Local Planning Authority represents a material change in circumstance since last year's study. No evidence has been put forward to demonstrate that apartment developments in this area of Caerphilly are uneconomic in the current market. I find that the 14 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
15. Pencoed Avenue (West), Cefn Fforest (Site 472) (47 units in dispute): Outline permission was originally granted for this allocated LDP site in 2001. Following permissions to extend the time limit in 2004 and 2007, a reserved matters application was granted in 2011. A third application to extend the time limit was granted after the base date of the study. The site has been included in the JHLAS since 2008; in last year's study it was not the subject of dispute. The HBF, Persimmon Homes and Asbri Planning consider that, due to the lack of developer interest, the site should be removed from the 5 year land supply. Paragraph 7.4.1 of the TAN indicates that there should be a "presumption to reclassify such sites into category 3i" unless an explanation is provided of why they should remain in category 2. While the Council provides an explanation, at the base date of the study there had been no change in the site's planning status since the 2012 JHLAS. Accordingly I do

not consider the explanation provided by the Council sufficient to override the 'presumption' sought by paragraph 7.4.1 of the TAN. I find that the 47 disputed units should be removed from the 5 year land supply.

16. The Monkey Public House, Crosskeys (Site 1867) (11 units in dispute): This site was first included in the 5 year land supply in the 2012 JHLAS, following the grant of full planning permission in June 2011. I note that the SoCG identifies the site as falling within the C1 and C2 flood risk zones, as identified by TAN 15. No Study Group member has identified flood plain issues as a constraint to development; I have therefore proceeded on the basis that the site is not constrained by its Zone C status. Asbri Planning and Persimmon consider that the site should be classified as 3i due to market constraints on apartments, but do not provide evidence to justify this view. I find that the 11 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
17. Greenhill Primary School, Gelligaer (Site 1777) (32 units in dispute): The HBF considers that this Council-owned site should be removed from the land supply as it has not been marketed and does not have planning permission. The site is, however, allocated in the adopted LDP and hence meets the criteria for inclusion in a JHLAS as set out at paragraph 7.1.2 of the TAN. The Council anticipates first completions from the site in year 3 of the study period. While there is a need to address remaining constraints to development and obtain planning permission prior to development commencing, I consider this phasing realistic. I find that the 32 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
18. Land at Gellideg Heights (Phase 1), Maesycwmmmer (Site 1749) (5 units in dispute): The parties agree that this site should contribute to the 5 year land supply. The area of dispute relates to the delivery of housing in year 3 of the study period. The Council anticipates that 35 dwellings will be completed in this year, whereas Asbri Planning and Persimmon consider that this should be reduced to 30. The Council accepts that this reduced figure is realistic but considers that additional affordable units could be delivered in tandem with market dwellings. This explanation is reasonable. I find that the 5 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
19. Land at Hawtin Park, Pontllanfraith (Site 1112) (17 units in dispute): This site is allocated in the LDP and is subject to an outline planning application. The parties agree that the site should contribute to the 5 year land supply, but the HBF, Asbri Planning and Persimmon contend that the rate of delivery is too high. As with the previous site (Site 1749), the Council considers that the delivery rate is realistic when considering completions from both affordable and market housing. Again, I find this to be a reasonable explanation. I also consider the phasing proposed by the Council to be realistic. I find that the 17 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.
20. Maerdy Crossing, Rhymney (Site 572) (57 units in dispute): This site is allocated in the adopted LDP. Although included in the JHLAS since 2006, the site was reclassified as category 3i in the 2012 JHLAS. It appears that this reclassification was due to the developer going into administration, rather than the presence of other constraints to the site's development. The HBF, Asbri Planning and Persimmon contend that the site has issues with deliverability and that until a new developer has been identified it should remain in category 3i. The Council considers that the purchase of the site by a new landowner and the granting of outline planning permission in August 2012 warrant its inclusion in the 5 year land supply. The Council also cites paragraph 7.3.4 of TAN 1, which states that for Category 2 sites "there should be a reasonable prospect of the site being sold for development where the land is not already owned by developers...". I agree with the Council that the change in the site's ownership and

planning status in the past year do indicate a reasonable prospect that it will be developed. The Council's proposed phasing for the site, with first completions in year 4 of the study, appears realistic. Accordingly I find that the 57 disputed units should be included in the 5 year land supply.

21. Land at Station Approach, Risca (Site 1124) (10 units in dispute): Although allocated in the LDP, this site has not been included in the 5 year land supply since 2008 due to the expiry of planning permission. The Council proposes to include the site in this year's land supply on the basis that a new outline planning application has been submitted by the landowner. Although the site is allocated in the LDP, as permission has not been granted and there is no other material change in circumstances since last year I do not consider there to be sufficient justification for reclassifying the site as category 2. I therefore find that the 10 disputed units should be removed from the 5 year land supply.

### **Conclusion**

22. For the above reasons, I find that of the 329 disputed units, 260 of them should be included in the 5 year land supply figure. Combined with the already agreed figure of 1,668 units, this brings the total land supply figure to 1,928 units.
23. Calculated using the residual method, and based on the agreed average annual completion of 667 units, I conclude that, as at 1 April 2013, the housing land supply for the Caerphilly County Borough Council planning area is 2.9 years.

*R.M. Poppleton*

**Inspector**